

**From:** [Jennifer Schultz - NOAA Federal](#)  
**To:** [Crane, Drew](#); [Rick Sayers@fws.gov](#); [Patrice Ashfield](#)  
**Subject:** Fwd: 316(b) files to forward  
**Date:** Wednesday, December 18, 2013 11:40:22 AM  
**Attachments:** [NMFS"Edits to EPA's proposal 12.18.2013.docx](#)  
[Modification of EPA's proposal \(NMFS format\)12.18.2013.docx](#)  
[\(b\)\(5\) Deliberative Process](#)

Attachments Withheld - b5 Deliberative  
Process

---

Revised documents!

**Jennifer Schultz, Ph.D.**

*Endangered Species Act Interagency Cooperation Division*  
*Office of Protected Resources*  
*NOAA Fisheries*  
*U.S. Department of Commerce*  
301-427-8443

[jennifer.schultz@noaa.gov](mailto:jennifer.schultz@noaa.gov)  
[www.nmfs.noaa.gov](http://www.nmfs.noaa.gov)



----- Forwarded message -----

**From:** **Jennifer Schultz - NOAA Federal** <[jennifer.schultz@noaa.gov](mailto:jennifer.schultz@noaa.gov)>  
**Date:** Wed, Dec 18, 2013 at 2:00 PM  
**Subject:** Re: 316(b) files to forward  
**To:** Pamela Lawrence - NOAA Federal <[pamela.lawrence@noaa.gov](mailto:pamela.lawrence@noaa.gov)>, Jennifer Schultz - NOAA Federal <[Jennifer.Schultz@noaa.gov](mailto:Jennifer.Schultz@noaa.gov)>  
**Cc:** Lois Schiffer - NOAA Federal <[lois.schiffer@noaa.gov](mailto:lois.schiffer@noaa.gov)>, Christine Blackburn - NOAA Federal <[christine.blackburn@noaa.gov](mailto:christine.blackburn@noaa.gov)>, Cathy Tortorici - NOAA Federal <[cathy.tortorici@noaa.gov](mailto:cathy.tortorici@noaa.gov)>, Alan Risenhoover - NOAA Federal <[alan.risenhoover@noaa.gov](mailto:alan.risenhoover@noaa.gov)>, Donna Wieting - NOAA Federal <[Donna.Wieting@noaa.gov](mailto:Donna.Wieting@noaa.gov)>, Brandon Sousa - NOAA Affiliate <[brandon.sousa@noaa.gov](mailto:brandon.sousa@noaa.gov)>

Here you go!

**Jennifer Schultz, Ph.D.**

*Endangered Species Act Interagency Cooperation Division*  
*Office of Protected Resources*  
*NOAA Fisheries*  
*U.S. Department of Commerce*  
[301-427-8443](tel:301-427-8443)

[jennifer.schultz@noaa.gov](mailto:jennifer.schultz@noaa.gov)  
[www.nmfs.noaa.gov](http://www.nmfs.noaa.gov)



On Wed, Dec 18, 2013 at 1:46 PM, Pamela Lawrence - NOAA Federal

<[pamela.lawrence@noaa.gov](mailto:pamela.lawrence@noaa.gov)> wrote:

Jennifer, can you add the attached language to each of the documents and forward?

Lois, (b)(5) Deliberative Process, (b)(5) Attorney-Client Communication

[REDACTED]

On Wed, Dec 18, 2013 at 1:38 PM, Lois Schiffer - NOAA Federal

<[lois.schiffer@noaa.gov](mailto:lois.schiffer@noaa.gov)> wrote:

(b)(5) Deliberative Process, (b)(5) Attorney-Client Communication

[REDACTED]

Sent from my iPhone

On Dec 18, 2013, at 1:27 PM, Jennifer Schultz - NOAA Federal

<[jennifer.schultz@noaa.gov](mailto:jennifer.schultz@noaa.gov)> wrote:

Hi Lois,

(b)(5) Deliberative Process, (b)(5) Attorney-Client Communication

[REDACTED]

Thanks,

Jenny

**Jennifer Schultz, Ph.D.**

*Endangered Species Act Interagency Cooperation Division*

*Office of Protected Resources*

*NOAA Fisheries*

*U.S. Department of Commerce*

[301-427-8443](tel:301-427-8443)

[jennifer.schultz@noaa.gov](mailto:jennifer.schultz@noaa.gov)

[www.nmfs.noaa.gov](http://www.nmfs.noaa.gov)



On Wed, Dec 18, 2013 at 1:01 PM, Lois Schiffer - NOAA Federal

<[lois.schiffer@noaa.gov](mailto:lois.schiffer@noaa.gov)> wrote:

here's my redline (attached because I don't know how to redline in email)

On Wed, Dec 18, 2013 at 12:53 PM, Pamela Lawrence - NOAA Federal <[pamela.lawrence@noaa.gov](mailto:pamela.lawrence@noaa.gov)> wrote:

(b)(5) Attorney-Client Communication, (b)(5) Deliberative Process [REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

On Wed, Dec 18, 2013 at 12:49 PM, Lois Schiffer - NOAA Federal <[lois.schiffer@noaa.gov](mailto:lois.schiffer@noaa.gov)> wrote:

(b)(5) Deliberative Process, (b)(5) Attorney-Client Communication [REDACTED]

(b)(5) Deliberative Process, (b)(5) Attorney-Client Communication

On Wed, Dec 18, 2013 at 12:43 PM, Pamela Lawrence - NOAA Federal <[pamela.lawrence@noaa.gov](mailto:pamela.lawrence@noaa.gov)> wrote:

(b)(5) Attorney-Client Communication, (b)(5) Deliberative Process

On Wed, Dec 18, 2013 at 12:36 PM, Christine Blackburn - NOAA Federal <[christine.blackburn@noaa.gov](mailto:christine.blackburn@noaa.gov)> wrote:  
Jenny....once again, thank you so much for all of this.

CB

On Wed, Dec 18, 2013 at 12:05 PM, Jennifer Schultz - NOAA Federal <[jennifer.schultz@noaa.gov](mailto:jennifer.schultz@noaa.gov)> wrote:

Hi Everyone,

Here are the revised documents for discussion at our 3:00 meeting.

Jenny

**Jennifer Schultz, Ph.D.**

*Endangered Species Act Interagency Cooperation Division*

*Office of Protected Resources*

*NOAA Fisheries*

*U.S. Department of Commerce*

[301-427-8443](tel:301-427-8443)

[jennifer.schultz@noaa.gov](mailto:jennifer.schultz@noaa.gov)

[www.nmfs.noaa.gov](http://www.nmfs.noaa.gov)



On Wed, Dec 18, 2013 at 9:50 AM, Cathy Tortorici - NOAA Federal <[cathy.tortorici@noaa.gov](mailto:cathy.tortorici@noaa.gov)> wrote:

Hello!

So Here is the latest on the project. I asked Jenny

I thought that would be helpful as we continue this dialog.

Rick Sayer from FWS just called me. Ted B. is going to call Lois to talk about next steps from FWS. [REDACTED]

There is likely to not to be anymore meetings with EPA at this point. Both Chris B. and Rick confirmed that with me.

(b)(5) Deliberative Process [REDACTED]

Thanks so much -

Cathy T.

----- Forwarded message -----

From: **Jennifer Schultz - NOAA Federal**

<[jennifer.schultz@noaa.gov](mailto:jennifer.schultz@noaa.gov)>

Date: Wed, Dec 18, 2013 at 9:43 AM

Subject: Re: 316(b) files to forward

To: Cathy Tortorici - NOAA Federal

<[cathy.tortorici@noaa.gov](mailto:cathy.tortorici@noaa.gov)>, Jennifer Schultz - NOAA Federal <[Jennifer.Schultz@noaa.gov](mailto:Jennifer.Schultz@noaa.gov)>

Hi Cathy,

Please use these files. I made one additional comment to the NMFS' edits that I believe is helpful.

On Wed, Dec 18, 2013 at 9:39 AM, Jennifer Schultz - NOAA Federal <[jennifer.schultz@noaa.gov](mailto:jennifer.schultz@noaa.gov)> wrote:

Hi Cathy,

Here is the (b)(5) Deliberative Process [REDACTED]

[REDACTED] 2) the comparison table.

Jenny

**Jennifer Schultz, Ph.D.**

*Endangered Species Act Interagency Cooperation Division*

*Office of Protected Resources*

*NOAA Fisheries*

*U.S. Department of Commerce*

[301-427-8443](tel:301-427-8443)

[jennifer.schultz@noaa.gov](mailto:jennifer.schultz@noaa.gov)

[www.nmfs.noaa.gov](http://www.nmfs.noaa.gov)



--

Cathy Tortorici  
Chief, ESA Interagency Cooperation Division  
Office of Protected Resources  
NOAA's National Marine Fisheries Service  
1315 East-West Highway  
Silver Spring, MD 20910  
(w) [301.427.8495](tel:301.427.8495)  
(c) [971.506.4052](tel:971.506.4052)  
[cathy.tortorici@noaa.gov](mailto:cathy.tortorici@noaa.gov)

--

Christine Blackburn  
NOAA Office of the Undersecretary  
office: [202-482-2351](tel:202-482-2351)  
mobile: [202-510-7805](tel:202-510-7805)

--

Pamela Lawrence, Attorney Advisor  
National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration  
U.S. Department of Commerce

--

[Lois Schiffer](#)  
General Counsel  
National Oceanic & Atmospheric Administration  
U.S. Department of Commerce  
Phone: 202-482-4080  
Cell: [REDACTED]  
Email: [Lois.Schiffer@noaa.gov](mailto:Lois.Schiffer@noaa.gov)

--

Pamela Lawrence, Attorney Advisor

National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration  
U.S. Department of Commerce

--

Lois Schiffer  
General Counsel  
National Oceanic & Atmospheric Administration  
U.S. Department of Commerce  
Phone: 202-482-4080  
Cell: [REDACTED]  
Email: [Lois.Schiffer@noaa.gov](mailto:Lois.Schiffer@noaa.gov)

--

Pamela Lawrence, Attorney Advisor  
National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration  
U.S. Department of Commerce